RESEARCH ON GENDER BARRIERS REGARDING WOMEN PARTICIPATION IN EDUCATION AND EMPLOYMENT IN TOURISM SECTOR IN KOSOVO
DRAFT REPORT

SUBMITTED TO: Syri i Vizionit

PREPARED BY: UBO Consulting

JANUARY 2015
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

CT Sector – Catering and Tourism Sector
VCT schools – Vocational Catering and Tourism Schools
EU – European Union
NGO – Non-government organization
SEED – Support of Educational and Employment Development in Albania, Kosovo and Serbia
MEST – Ministry of Science Education and Technology
MLSW – Ministry of Labour and Social Wellbeing
VTC – Vocational Training Centres
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>EXECUTIVE SUMMARY</strong></td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. INTRODUCTION</strong></td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 OVERVIEW OF TOURISM SECTOR IN KOSOVO</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 PROJECT APPROACH</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. RESULTS</strong></td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 VCT SCHOOLS</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 EMPLOYMENT IN CATERING AND TOURISM SECTOR</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. CONCLUSIONS</strong></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. RECOMMENDATIONS</strong></td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANEKSI I: CONFERENCE ORGANIZED REGARDING PRESENTATION OF THE RESULTS DERIVED FROM THIS RESEARCH</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANNEX II: DETAILED LIST OF EMPLOYERS AND STAKEHOLDERS THAT WERE PART OF THE SURVEY</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1. Future career in Catering and Tourism ................................................................. 15
Figure 2. Future career in Catering and Tourism Industry .................................................... 16
Figure 3. Criteria’s for career in CT industry ........................................................................ 16
Figure 4. Continue career in CT industry .............................................................................. 17
Figure 5. Satisfaction with Curricula and Academic staff ....................................................... 19
Figure 6. Internships provided to students ............................................................................ 20
Figure 7. How to increase women enrolment in VCT schools and employment in CT sector 21
Figure 8. Experience in CT industry ...................................................................................... 22
Figure 9. How did you find current job? ................................................................................ 23
Figure 10. Qualifications regarding CT job vacancies ............................................................ 24
Figure 11. Working conditions in CT industry ...................................................................... 24
Figure 12. Reasons to quit current job .................................................................................. 25
Figure 13. Job positions available in CT industry ................................................................. 26
Figure 14. Criteria that are considered most when hiring new employees ............................ 27
Figure 15. Reasons why small number of women work in CT industry ............................... 27
Figure 16. Previously employed VCT students .................................................................... 28
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Tourism is one of the most complex business industries of today's society. In developed countries, but also in countries in transition such as Kosovo, Catering and Tourism plays a really important economic and employment generator. It includes a wide range of phenomena and specifics, while its operation as a sector not only improves citizen wellbeing in economic terms, but also in environmental, social and cultural and life development terms.

In Kosovo tourism has started to show itself as an important economic engine. It has started to show positive indicators during winter and summer, through employing many youngsters. One issue or problem that is following the development of the tourism sector is the low level of education of the employees regarding this sector, and specifically of women employees. In this regard Syri i Vizionit through implementation of a SEED project, has commissioned UBO Consulting to perform a survey that is intended to draw conclusions and recommendation on the situation on the ground regarding tourism, assessing the level of education of current employees catering and tourism, and employment of women in this sector (assessing low level of employment, what measures to be taken in increasing education of women per this sector which also would result in the increase of employment of women).

In order to achieve these objectives, a hybrid of quantitative and qualitative methodology was developed, including: review of existing literature; semi-structured interviews with students enrolled at vocational schools for tourism (men and women), in-depth interviews with employers and employees engaged in tourism sector, and with key stakeholders (vocational schools for tourism directors, vocational training centres’ directors, regional employment office directors, and relevant central level stakeholders).

Main findings

VCT Schools

- 48.5 percent of students were interested to be professionally engaged in the future in Catering and Tourism industry therefore they have chosen to attend VCT schools, and 33.3% of students stated they it was the school program that could most probably find you a job in the future that made them enrol in VCT schools.

- 92.8 percent of students claimed they will continue attaining education and get employed in Catering and Tourism sector, and on the other hand 7.2% of the interviewed students declared that they were not so interested.
Top challenges and difficulties of Catering and Tourism sector were high unemployment among both men and women, nepotism shown from employers while hiring new employees, low wages, poor working conditions, and stigmatization of women employed in CT sector.

The following list provides information on the suggested actions that would increase employment of women in CT sector, actions that were suggested by students:
- Promote VCT schools in media
- Reach employment agreements between businesses and VCT schools,
- Agreeing on securing number of job positions for women only
- Hire women in senior positions

Representatives of Ministry of Education Science and Technology, were of opinion that curricula that are used in VCT schools should be revised, modified and changed if needed, but prior to that market analysis of CT sector employment should be done first.

School headmasters were pessimistic that the situation regarding small number of women enrolled in VCT Schools will change in the next 5 years. They stated that the situation could change only if there are strategic plans performed with the sole intention of educating women in this regard.

Representatives of Ministry of Labour and Social Wellbeing (MLSW) agreed that cooperation should be raised in national, regional, and local level, which means that private and public (including NGOs and donators) stakeholders should work together in finding ways to support women in terms of education and employment regarding Catering and Tourism sector.

**Employment**

36.1 percent of employees working in this sector answered said that working in CT sector is their first job experience. The other 63.9% of employees said that it was not their first job experience.
- Employees that were interviewed have indicated some reasons that made them to quit their previous job, which are:
  - “Unsatisfied with the salary” with 62%,
  - “Hard working conditions (extended working hours, and transportation)” with 22%, and
  - “Unfair and prejudice treatment by staff and customers” with 16%

- 76 percent of employees declared that they haven’t attained any previous professional training, or academic degree regarding CT sector, while the other 24 percent of employees admitted to have attained trainings or have academic background related to Catering and Tourism sector.

- According to 88 percent of employers, the reason why women do not work in CT sector is their low interest which according to them is happens because of the stigmatization of women which in the region of Dukagjini is still evident, their low level of education/skills for performing in senior positions, and this is another reason why women are not interested in working in CT sector.

- Employers’ said that in previous years (and currently) they had very small cooperation with VCT schools, in terms of hiring students for intern positions. They noted their dissatisfaction regarding the professionalism shown by these students, by assessing majority of interns as totally unskilled, unprofessional, and disinterested.

- When employers were asked whether they currently have employed someone who has finished VCT School, 43.5% said yes; another 18% said they have previously employed employees that have finished VCT School; while the other 38.5% said to have never employed employees that have finished VCT schools.

The first part of this report provides a background of the tourism sector, with a focus on elaboration of the rationale of this research project. Following that is the research methodology used to address the objectives of this study. The rest of the report focuses on the elaboration of the results, providing an in-depth analysis of the key issues that emerged during this research project. Lastly, the report presents the conclusions derived from the analysis, while also providing recommendations for future actions.
1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Overview of Tourism Sector in Kosovo

Kosovo as a newly-formed state is taking very important steps towards establishing a functioning state with the clear European perspective. During these 15 years (especially since declaration of independence in 2008) Kosovo has been committed in reviving its economy, strengthening governing state institutions (state of law) and gain international recognition through reaching economic, cultural, and other multilateral agreements as a pre-condition for European integration. Along these years, political and social improvements were more evident, whereas the economy is still struggling, taking into consideration the latest mass immigration of youth to EU countries for better life and more employment opportunities.

Currently the economy of Kosovo is mostly identified with trade, service delivery, and manufacturing goods, as main sectors of economy. The problem is that Kosovo's economy is still being identified with high level of unemployment and low level of skilled people (those seeking employment) which is because of lack of education, poor quality of education, lack of professional trainings, etc.

In recent years Kosovo economy has started showing positive indications in the development of other sectors such as tourism, specifically cultural tourism, attraction and national parks (Rugova National Park, Sharr Mountains, Mirusha, Ancient Castles, etc.), tour guides, and transportation. Tourism in Kosovo has shown an indication that has the potential of creating jobs and encouraging income-generating activities for local communities in specific areas. This sector in many countries is identified as an engine of the overall economic growth because of its diversity, but in Kosovo it is a different story mainly due to the poor economy that Kosovo faced for many decades, and due to 99’ armed conflict which has damaged country’s economy a lot.

Compared to other sectors of economy, tourism industry is one of the fastest growing, in the region. Hotels and restaurants, tour guides, and transportation could have a huge potential in 1) reducing poverty for local communities, 2) growing employment opportunities, and 3) improving general citizens’ wellbeing (social and cultural impact). This also means tourism could play a significant source of employment and placing it among the sectors in development which require varying degrees of skills and allow for quick entry into the workforce by youth, and specifically by women. However, there are a number of conditions under which tourism sector can show better results in generating employment opportunities and play a substantial role in overall economic growth. This requires collaboration of all stakeholders - governments and intergovernmental bodies, local government, trade unions, local communities, NGO’s, community based tourism initiatives, etc. because
the role of these actors is identified as key to developing the tourism industry. Partnerships between the private and public sectors should be enhanced to ensure more effective coordination and benefits for local communities.

Employment in tourism sector in Kosovo, especially in Dukagjini region, has some peculiarities of its own which makes this sector promising on one hand, and on the other it reveals the challenges that follow this sector. The following are presented some of the features of tourism of this part of Kosovo:

- Suitable climate for winter and summer tourism
- Good geographical position (near urban settlements)
- Cultural Tourism (representing values and traditions of local communities)

On the other hand here are some of the challenges that this sector is currently facing:

- Sustainable Employment (summer-winter)
- Lack of professional staff / skills related to this sector
- Very small number of the employed females
- Lack of investment in this sector by all stakeholders
- Lack of coordination of activities of stakeholders (public, private, donors and foreign investors)

The tourism industry represents a huge economic factor and its environmental and social impacts could be very promising to the overall wellbeing of citizens living in Dukagjini Region. The tourism sector provides various entry points for women's employment and opportunities for creating self-employment in small and medium sized income generating activities, thus creating paths towards the elimination of poverty of women and local communities. In addition, integrating gender pre-conditions while analysing tourism is particularly important as the catering and tourism industry should be one major employer of women, which could offer various opportunities for independent income generating activities and at the same time, affects their lives by improving their social status in the community.

The problem lies in the fact that currently a very small number of women are employed in this sector, and most of them are those who are part of family businesses. Furthermore, small progress has been made in women’s education and training regarding catering and tourism sector in Kosovo in the past 15 years. Today, young women do have the possibility to have a better education level, and equal opportunities legislation has been introduced and improved to provide a legal framework to safeguard against all types of discrimination in education and employment. But due to stigmatization of women working in catering and tourism industry by the society (especially from family members, and men), employment of women in this sector is very low.
1.2 PROJECT APPROACH

Taken into considerations these lately developments many stakeholders such as local institutions (central, and local) international donors, and the business community have taken activities and provided support for Tourism Sector in Kosovo.

One of the projects that is being implemented by a donor currently is the NGO framework programme SEED of Volkshilfe Solidarität financed by the Austrian development agency, which seeks to improve the access to labour market for women and youth in order to alleviate poverty and to contribute to gender equality. The abbreviation SEED stands for “Support of Educational and Employment Development in Albania, Kosovo and Serbia”. Syri i Vizionit is the implementing Partner in Kosovo under this framework program and as part of this project, has issued to conduct a survey on “Gender barriers in the field of women’s participation in education and employment in the tourism/hotel sector in Kosovo”. On November 2014, UBO Consulting was commissioned by Syri I Vizionit NGO.

The main objective of this gender barrier study is to provide an in-depth analysis of the reasons for underrepresentation of women in Kosovo’s tourism industry and the hotel sector. The study is intended to reveal main obstacles and identify possible positive factors for employment in the tourism and hotel industry for women in the Dukagjini region. More specifically the study will try to reveal:

- Main obstacles for employees to get engaged in tourism
- Furthering positive factors for employees to enter the tourism and hotel industry
- Getting information on the obstacles for women to get engaged in different occupations functions in tourism
- Student motivation for their school choice (topic of tourism)
- Getting information regarding reasons for the fact that only few young women choose tourism for their vocational education as their personal career objective
- Getting information on main obstacles to reach women personal career objectives
- Identification of hindering and supporting factors of getting engaged in the tourism sector in overall
- Number and level of jobs offered per occupation (function) for men and women
- Reasons to engage men or women for specific occupations (functions) in tourism
- Willingness to offer trainee positions to young women in their businesses (supporting and hindering factors)
- Employers opinion about obstacles for women to get engaged in different occupations (functions) in tourism
In this regard UBO Consulting has prepared a report with the data analysed. The purpose of this report is three-fold:

- Firstly it aimed to analyse data (both quantitative and qualitative) in order to reach important conclusions on the situation of tourism and gender barriers that are posed to women regarding their employment
- Secondly it aimed to be able to provide relevant and conclusive facts regarding the tourism gaps and positive factors
- And thirdly, it aimed to draw recommendations that have derived through combining interviews with key stakeholders, and results that have derived from other target groups
2. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

In regard to the project “Gender Barriers Regarding Women Participation in Education and Employment in Tourism Sector in Kosovo”, a thoroughly survey was conducted, which was done through combined quantitative and qualitative. The process of measuring the perceptions and getting relevant information was conducted according to international professional standards for quantitative survey methodologies, including questionnaire development and validation, data collection & analysis, and reporting. The information obtained from the survey and research conducted by the UBO Consulting research team will provide the necessary insights as per the objectives of the study that were set by the client.

Specifically this survey was implemented through:

- **Desk review** - Literature research and analysis of existing studies
- **In depth interviews** with relevant representatives/stakeholders:
  - a. 37 in-depth interviews with employees engaged in tourism (men and women)
  - b. 35 in-depth interviews with employers in the tourism industry (men and women)
  - c. 12 in-depth interviews with key stakeholders (vocational schools for tourism directors, vocational training centres’ directors, regional employment office directors, and relevant central level stakeholders).
- **Quantitative/qualitative survey** – 107 quantitative/qualitative surveys with students enrolled at vocational schools for tourism (men and women)
- **Focus group discussion** – One focus group session was organized with 10 male respondents (initially it was planned to organize and additional FG session with women students, but due to the small number of them attending VCT schools we have conducted face to face in-depth interviews with each of them)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>In-depth interviews</th>
<th>Quantitative/Qualitative interviews</th>
<th>Focus Groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Employees</td>
<td>Employers</td>
<td>Relevant Stakeholders</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>37</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
As per the **Desk Review**, the following actions were conducted:

Initially a document review took place by reviewing existing documents i.e. documents, reports, studies, strategies, and other relevant documents that were relevant to tourism sector, and gender related barriers. Desk Research team gathered and analysed all available documents (secondary data) that were directly related to project objectives:

- Studies, research works or evaluations applying to the overall objective that were previously conducted (studies performed by Syri i Vizionit)

Desk research team looked for what helped answering the main objectives, and pre-setting some points on which questionnaires were later designed. UBO Consulting expert team has prepared 4 types of questionnaires which are: a) questionnaire for students, b) questionnaire for employers, c) questionnaire for employees, and d) questionnaire for stakeholders.

As per the **Research using Interviewing Technique** the following phases were performed:

**Phase 1- Preparatory phase**

*Finalization of questionnaires:* In developing both quantitative and qualitative questionnaires and then using interviewers to administer it, we paid attention to several points: using simple language that would be easily understood by the respondents, and we didn’t use leading questions that would strongly suggest a particular response. Once the survey questions were developed, a particular attention was paid to order them logically in the questionnaire.

*Recruitment of survey team:* The team was carefully selected with preference given to experienced researcher. The selected field work team comprised of 7 fieldworkers, one field supervisor, four data processing and entry personnel and one project coordinator. The fieldwork supervisor allowed for supervision in all the regions being surveyed (Peja, Prizren, and Gjakova).

*Training of survey team:* One-day training was delivered to interviewers. The purpose of this training was to ensure that: i) enumerators fully understand the survey questions, ii) enumerators are familiar with the methodology of sampling and interviewing, and iii) enumerators are effective interviewers and can administer the interviews easily, accurately, consistently, and naturally.
Phase 2 - Data Collection

**Fieldwork:** Field work was carried out from 11th to 22nd December 2014.

**Quality Checks:** This was an integral part of fieldwork. Quality check comprised of:
- The field supervisor was responsible for carrying out the first quality control by screening each questionnaire submitted.
- The second level of quality control was carried out by data entry personnel inputting the data in the electronic database.

Phase 3 - Data entry, tabulation, and analysis

The data entry and analysis for quantitative part of the study was realized in SPSS and tables were generated as per the analysis plan that was finalized in consultation with the report writing team.

- Data validation (cleaning) is an important part of any process that involves large volumes of data. Our experienced data validation professionals ensured that the data did not contain any unwanted codes, errors, inconsistencies, or missing data.
- Cross-tabulations were generated to reveal association between data based on a number of variables (those relevant to the objectives of the study).

Since researchers have performed many semi-structured interviews (qualitative research methodology), data were analysed through MAXQDA software which is the adequate tool to analyse qualitative data. MAXQDA is professional software for qualitative and mixed methods of data analysis. It is designed for computer-assisted qualitative and mixed methods data, text and multimedia analysis in academic, scientific, and business institutions. On our case it also helped us create frequency tables and charts (Statistics and Graphics).

As per the Research using Focus group discussion the following phases were performed:

The focus group session was organized in Gjakova on 18th of December 2014.

Initially we have planned to conduct two FG discussions since focus group sessions were structured in a gender-specific manner in order to encourage more discussion from the female participants. In reality we have organized one focus group session with 12 male respondents. The FG with women students was not organized due to the small number of them attending VCT schools we have conducted face to face in-depth interviews with each of them.

*Check **ANNEX I** for a detailed list of employers and stakeholders interviewed.*
3. RESULTS

3.1 VCT Schools

In order to gain more insight information as per the functionality of VCT schools, student satisfaction on the knowledge they are attaining, students’ motivation for their school choice, getting information regarding reasons why only few young women choose tourism for their vocational education as their personal career objective, etc., UBO Consulting research team has administered semi-structured questionnaires with students attending these schools, school headmasters, and representatives from Ministry of Education Science and Technology.

The following will provide analysed data that have derived based on the responses derived from the aforementioned respondents.

Initially students were asked to tell why they have chosen to attend Vocational Catering and Tourism Schools. 48.5% of them declared they were always interested to be professionally engaged in Catering and Tourism industry, and 33.3% of students stated they it was the school program that according to them could most probably find you a job in the future that made them choose to study at this school. On the other hand 9.1% of students were enrolled because their families had businesses operating in this sector. Only 9.1% of the students declared that it was not their interest at all to join VCT schools, by explaining that it was because they were not admitted to other school programs, that made them enrol at VCT schools.

Figure 1. Future career in Catering and Tourism
No major differences could be observed in this regard between men and women respondents, as can be seen in the graph below, mainly because the number of women interviewed was too small.

**Figure 2. Future career in Catering and Tourism Industry**

- **I am interested in the future to be engaged in Catering and Tourism Industry**
  - Women: 33.30%
  - Men: 48.48%

- **The most probable school program that can find you job in the future**
  - Women: 33.30%
  - Men: 33.34%

- **I was not accepted in another school program**
  - Women: 0%
  - Men: 9.09%

- **We have a family business in this sector**
  - Women: 33.40%
  - Men: 9.09%

The vast majority of students (78%) interviewed acknowledged the fact that those interested to pursue career in Catering and Tourism industry, should be equipped with trainings or academic degree in order to have a promising career in this sector.

**Figure 3. Criteria’s for career in CT industry**

- 78%: Those interested to pursue career in Catering and Tourism industry, should equip with trainings and academic degree in order to have a promising career in CT industry

- 22%: CT industry does not require specific education pre-conditions, except work experience

When students were asked whether they believe that in the future they will continue attaining education and get employed in Catering Tourism sector, 92.8% of them...
stated they will continue to do so, and on the other hand 7.2% of students were not of that opinion.

In this regard, all women interviewed declared that they will follow to pursue their career in Tourism Sector, whereas only 6 men declared that they will not pursue their academic and professional career in this sector. They said that they plan to leave Kosovo as soon as they finish high school. It is an interesting fact that almost half of men interviewed declared that they will not continue education with Tourism background, and they really hope that they will find a job in this sector immediately after they finish high school.

During in-depth interviews with women, they were asked to provide more explanations on why they have chosen to study VCT schools, and what are their future plans in terms of academic or professional engagement in Tourism sector. Most of them declared that they will continue to pursue academic career in this sector, because it is very hard for women to find a decent job in this sector immediately after finishing high school. Two of women interviewed said that they will get employed when they finish high school, and this is solely due to some relatives and friends that they know that will assist them in getting employed.
Students were asked to mention some of the top challenges and difficulties that they may face while trying to create a professional career in Catering and Tourism sector. The following table shows men and women concerns:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top Challenges and Difficulties for Men</th>
<th>Top Challenges and Difficulties for Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High level of unemployment</td>
<td>High level of unemployment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nepotism shown from employers</td>
<td>Stigmatization of women employed in CT sector</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low wages</td>
<td>Lower job positions offered to women</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Poor working conditions (working hours, no transport)</td>
<td>Low wages</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impossible job promotion</td>
<td>Poor working conditions (working hours, no transport)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Most women and men have preferred to work in Catering and Tourism industry on these positions:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Top job positions preferred by Men</th>
<th>Top job positions preferred by Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Main chef – 32%</td>
<td>Main chef - 38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff manager – 30%</td>
<td>Staff manager - 23%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waiter – 16%</td>
<td>Event manager - 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barmen- 14%</td>
<td>Tour operator - 15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manager Assistant - 11%</td>
<td>Reception - 11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chef assistant - 11%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tour operator - 8%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is an interested fact that only 8% of men and 15% of women suggested tour operator (travel agencies) job position as one of preferred ones.
On the other hand situation with tour guide is more critical since no student of both genders proposed such job position. When conducting focus groups and in-depth interviews both men and women attending VCT schools stated that they have very little information regarding employment such as tour guides, and alpinism and similar related fields and they would like to know more in this regard.

Student were also asked to assess their level of satisfaction regarding academic staff of VCT schools, and assess current curricula that these schools provide, and 91% of interviewed students were positive and declared satisfied with their teachers, and 85% of them stated that curricula provided is up-to-date.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Satisfaction with Curricula</th>
<th>Satisfaction with Academic Staff</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>85%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>91%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No</td>
<td>9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

On the other hand 9% of students that declared unsatisfied with academic staff justified their opinion by saying that teachers are not interested that much in teaching students properly, and furthermore they think that they are not that capable of teaching up-to-date knowledge regarding tourism specifics.

82% of students that were interviewed acknowledged the fact that they have benefited practical classes from schools, while the other 18% said they have not had the chance to benefit from practical lessons offered from schools, or they didn’t show interest to it.
The table below provides types of interns students have benefited, and reasons why, of those who didn’t benefit practical classes:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Types of Practical classes benefited</th>
<th>Reasons why they didn’t benefit practical classes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Waiter – 56%</td>
<td>Already engaged in family business - 53%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Barmen - 22%</td>
<td>Showed no interest in benefiting internships - 25%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reception – 12%</td>
<td>School didn’t organize any yet - 22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chef assistant - 10%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When students were asked what measures should be taken in order to increase the number of youngsters, and specifically women, in attending VCT schools and gaining professional trainings in regard to Catering and Tourism Sector, the provided several responses, such as: “Provision of employment opportunities after graduation (seasonal, or long-term employment)” with 77%; “Intensive promotion of VCT schools and CT modules in the media” with 35.9%, and “Financial support in term of investments from donors and institutions in order to increase employment in CT sector” with 23.5%.
During in-depth interviews women were asked who and what could be done in order to increase the number of women enrolled in VCT schools and in the increase of women employed in Catering and Tourism sector. They have provided the following list of suggestions of deeds that could be done in the near future in order to change the current situation:

**Suggested actions that would increase interest of women to attend VCT schools**

- Promote VCT schools in media
- Promise employment after graduating from VCT schools

**Suggested actions that would increase employment of women in CT sector**

- Reach employment agreements between businesses and VCT schools, specifically agreeing on securing number of job positions for women only
- Hire women in senior positions

---

**Figure 7. Means to increase women enrolment in VCT schools and employment in CT Sector**

- Provision of employment opportunities after graduation (seasonal, or long-term employment) - 77%
- Financial support in term of investments from donors and institutions in order to increase employment in CT sector - 23.5%
- Intensive promotion of VCT schools and CT modules in the media - 35.9%
3.2 Employment in Catering and Tourism Sector

**Employees’ results**

Employment in Catering and Tourism sector, for Dukagjini region and especially for women is very promising, although the current situation shows a different picture. To obtain more information and better assess the situation in which this sector currently is, and in regard to employment in general and employment of women, UBO Consulting research team has conducted in-depth interviews with businesses operating, and the employees working in the CT sector.

Initially employees working in this sector have been asked to tell as whether their current job in CT sector is their first job experience, and 36.1% of them answered with Yes, while the other 63.9% of employees said that this is not their first job experience.

![Figure 8: Experience in CT industry](image)

Those who declared that their current job is not their first experience, have indicated some reasons that made them to quit their previous job, which are: “Unsatisfied with the salary” with 62%, “Hard working conditions (extended working hours, and transportation)” with 22%, and “Unfair and prejudice treatment by staff and customers” with 16%. It should be noted that the last option as a reason to quit their previous job was provided only by women respondents.

Further information was requested from employees who said that current job was not their first experience, which was on sharing information about previous work experiences and were they related to this work experience. Around 70 % of respondents claimed to have worked in Catering industry previously, while the other
30% stated that they have worked different jobs but not related to Catering and Tourism.

This result is an indication that employees that have previously worked in CT industry tend still to work in this industry, and this result is also indicative for businesses operating in this sector, because they tend to hire employees who have already previous work experience in this sector.

When respondents were asked how they got their current job, only 11% of them said to have applied for the job, interviewed and then hired, and only 8% of respondents claimed to have been assisted by the corresponding Employment Office at their municipality. Eighty one percent of employees interviewed declared it was their friends and family (family business) who helped them find this job.

**Figure 9. How did you find current job?**

- **Friends and Family assisted in finding this job**: 81%
- **Through public job vacancy announcement**: 11%
- **Employment office assisted me in finding this job**: 8%

It is a very interesting fact that when the respondents were asked as whether apart from their work experience, have they attained any previous professional trainings, or academic degree, regarding the Catering and Tourism sector, a great number of them answered negative (76%), while the other 24 percent of respondents admitted to have attained trainings or academic degree related to Catering and Tourism sector.
When the respondents were asked whether they like current working conditions, and is the treatment or working conditions different for men and women, the following results emerged: 65% of respondents were of opinion that working conditions are fine but not great, while the other 35% percent of the employees interviewed said that working conditions are very poor (salary, working hours) and leaving current job is just a matter of time.

Those employees who are thinking to quit current job noted some options as the main reasons they would quit which are: “Greater Salary” with 92%, “Better working conditions” with 75%, “Future academic career” with 33%, “Not bearable anymore” with 25%.
Women employees were more eager to speak about the differences in treatment while at work. They were of opinion that management staff treats all employees equal, no matter what gender they are, but the problem remains with the customers, especially in Catering and Tourism industry where many women have been a subject of sexual harassment, and because of that they were prompted to leave their job.

Respondent were also asked to share opinions on how would the number of women increase in getting academic background related to Catering and Tourism, and how would the employment of women in this sector increase. Since they are already employed and they do know something about the situation of employment in Catering and Tourism industry respondents shared the following opinions:

- Foreign and local investors should invest in CT industry, which would generate more job vacancies which would mean and more opportunities for women
- Local and central institutions should do more in assisting and supporting those women who have already finished VCT schools, in order to make them as successful examples
- Promoting VCT schools in media
**Employment sector results**

With the aim of completing and obtaining more insight information on employment in the Catering and Tourism sector, our research team has interviewed businesses that operate in this sector. They were asked about the challenges they have with finding employees, employees’ qualifications, and their opinions regarding future collaboration between important actors and the business community.

First we wanted to know more information about employers’ current position regarding staff, respectively what positions do employers most hire, and their satisfaction with their employees. According to information provided, the following job positions were most available:

![Figure 13. Job positions available in CT industry](image)

It is an interesting fact that businesses operating as tour operators and travel agencies are most interested in hiring front desk clerks. On the other hand those businesses involved in Catering are most interested in hiring waiters, barmen, cook, and cleaning. These businesses (catering) have acknowledged a fact that it is not in their favour, which is that employees working in these positions, they more often quit work, and what is worse, they do it without notice. This presents a problem for businesses because it is difficult to immediately substitute effectively a worker in these positions.

When employers were asked as to what criteria they consider first, when hiring new employees, 65% of them said that work experience is something they value most, while the other 35% would first consider employees’ education/training related to the job position they are hiring.
Information that were given by employers was regarding the low interest of women in working in Catering and Tourism sector. According to most of employers the reason why women do not work in this sector is because of their low interest which according to employers it happens because of the stigmatization of women which in the region of Dukagjini is still evident (88%), and their low level of education/skills for performing senior positions which is another factor why women are not interested in working in CT sector.

Regarding employers’ knowledge about VCT schools and Vocational Training Centers in the region of Peja, Prizren, and Gjakova, majority of them claimed to have more information about VCT schools than VTCs operating in Dukagjini Region. They said that in previous years (and ongoing) they have small cooperation with VCT schools, in terms of hiring their students for internships and very rarely for seasonal work (only 2 businesses admitted to have done that).
In this regard they noted their dissatisfaction regarding the professionalism shown by the students, which according to employers only few of interns showed interest and focus while on the job and the other were totally unskilled, unprofessional, and disinterested.

As per Vocational Training Centers, business representatives said to have no cooperation with them, since they are coordinated by the Employment Office, and they based on their previous experiences with Employment Office they were not satisfied at all with the quality of employees they addressed to them.

When employers were asked whether they currently have employed someone who has finished VCT School, 43.5% said yes; another 18% said they have previously employed employees that have finished VCT School; while the other 38.5% said to have never employed employees that have finished VCT schools.

**Figure 16. Previously employed VCT students**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Have previously employed employees finished VCT school</td>
<td>18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Never had employees who finished VCT school</td>
<td>38.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Currently have employees who finished VCT school</td>
<td>43.5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

When employers interviewed were asked whether they would agree to cooperate with VCT schools, and Employment offices in terms of recruiting young employees, they unanimously said they would but under some conditions. They want assurance on the quality of the candidates these institutions propose, and they also are of agreement that they would agree to raise the level of cooperation with VCT schools, Employment office, and other relevant stakeholders who is interested in improving business environment regarding Catering and Tourism sector.
The ways they could hire candidates proposed by VCT schools and Employment Office are:

- Seasonal work
- Long-term work
- Internship

Employers also noted that they should stay informed about the events that are related to their sector of operation, and they want assistance from institutions when it comes to supporting women in maternity leave because according to them they still cannot cover operation costs while covering women employees’ maternity leave.

Employers also expressed their willingness to hire more women, with only one condition, women to be able to perform high quality work performance.
4. CONCLUSIONS

Results have shown very interesting and useful data that made it possible to analyse the situation in the tourism sector and more specifically to derive the information concerning the high unemployment of women in this sector, and the reasons for such situation.

From research conducted with students which attended classes in VCT Schools, has turned out that most of them have aspirations to continue in the future their education related to tourism, or to engage professionally in the tourism sector. The important fact is that women who are small in number think the same way for their future.

From the answers that we got from women attending VCT Schools, it has resulted that the reasons why women resist to find job in this sector are: a) social prejudices of the (society in general, their personal family and especially males); 2) current unattractive job positions offered to women such as maintenance, and cleaning, and not in management positions; and 3) women poor education/job skills regarding attractive job positions.

Most women and men have preferred to work on these positions Catering and Tourism Sector: chef, staff manager, event manager, waiter, and tour operator (travel agencies).

Regarding curricula’s applied in VCT Schools, several stakeholders from the employment office and Vocational Training Centres are of the opinion that the current curricula should be revised and changed while taking into account the situation on the field, through evaluating the labour market of Catering and Tourism sector (business demands for specific labour positions, and what skills specifically). While on the other hand the ministry officials have stated that since 2000 until now, the curriculum was changed 3 times in accordance with the requirements of the labour market, and in the near future they say they will apply the same procedure again.

Another idea was recommended from VCT school headmasters, which according to them ministry of education should pilot test a class with women only, and with a specific curricula based on their most liked current professions in tourism sector. Prior to that, they suggested to perform awareness campaigns in raising awareness among women and their families on the benefits that they could gain when choosing this profession, and to reach mutual agreements between school and business community in order to hire these women (seasonal, or long-term employment).
Many of the businesses interviewed, representative of Employment Office, and women interviewed have also raised a concern which is about maternity leave. They unanimously agree that they would probably hire more women in the future in case local and central institutions would assist businesses in paying maternity leave compensation.

From this survey it has emerged (stakeholders, employers and employees, as well as students) that the increase of women pursuing academic education in the field of Catering and Tourism, and increase of their employment in this sector, could be solved through engaging both public and private stakeholders and coordinating their activities and promoting this sector as an attractive employment sector.

Some stakeholders (employer office), and women interviewed (students, and employees) have suggested that providing grants and micro-credits to women to pursue business career in Tourism sector, (as self-employed) would be one of the best ways of increasing women employment in this sector.
5. RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommendations for stakeholders involved in tourism industry

Local governments, employers, business associations and other relevant community groups should jointly create community based committees in order to assist women while on maternity leave in terms of securing them their jobs. The level of cooperation should be enhanced and institutionalized, especially between businesses and schools, since cooperation right now is very little. Collaboration should be raised at higher level, where students should be able to benefit internships, and also when businesses labour needs are at stake, institutions relevant to this matter, should address and work in the direction that VCT schools and students that finish VCT schools should be the solution address, whether curricula are needed to be changed, or employment and internship opportunities are available. Furthermore when targeting women employees, businesses should be supported financially with their obligations to women employees that are on maternity leave, since according to business respondents it is a serious challenge for businesses to keep women employees, because of financial implications.

Supporting women to become self-employed through tourism-related activities should be linked with micro-credit programs or grants provided by donators. Loans and grants to women’s initiatives should be included as a means of creating opportunities for the industry to buy & source locally, thus maximising the benefits for local communities.

Improving access to education and improving the standard of education in destination area should be an important long-term strategy. The curricula used in VCT schools should be periodically assessed, revised, and modified by competent experts at Ministry of Science Technology and Education, in order to be consistent with labour market needs. Initially an assessment of the labour market needs should be performed in order to evaluate the current curricula, employee’s professionalism, and to assess the need for change of the current curricula. Based on recommendations assessed from the businesses it turns out that education and training should focus on marketing, financial management, literacy and foreign languages.

Awareness raising campaigns initiated by governments, tourism boards, industry, and NGOs should aim at creating a better understanding of different cultures among consumers; school curricula should address issues of cross-cultural respect, ideally as part of an education for universal citizenship.

Women should be encouraged to get involved in independent community based tourism initiatives (an important part of strategic planning for women participation in tourism), through promoting the opportunities, offering advice, contacts and networks, training and education, access to information and access to credit - by
national and local governments, trade unions, NGOs and industry collaborating with women's local initiatives.

**Recommendations for donators**

National, regional and international networking among women being involved in tourism activities should be built up more effectively and widespread. Relevant stakeholders should provide financial resources to conduct necessary research and set up stakeholder steering committees combining with research studies in order to have consistent data for this sector, and to be able to track the situation of employment of women in this sector.

**Recommendations for National and Local Governments**

National government should report more comparable, precise and gender disaggregated data about women’s employment in tourism to interested stakeholders, and also provides support.

Government regulation should create effective incentives for employers to take measures towards the advancement of women.

Government departments that deal with tourism and local authorities should become more efficiently engaged as important players at the local level. The capability of these official agencies for facilitating participatory processes needs to be built up.

**Recommendations for the Tourism Industry**

Employers should set up programmes and schemes encouraging women to move into non-traditional occupations, invest in women’s training, and appoint them in managerial positions.

The tourism industry/stakeholders should collaborate with local income generating initiatives on the basis of their shared interest to support and improve tourism sector and women employment. Local and national tourist agencies can play an important role in promoting community based tourism initiatives and their products.

Employers should review their standards and criteria of employing women and men, and their policies to protect women from sexual objectification and sexual harassment by customers. Employers have a major role to play in applying appropriate and equitable criteria and providing effective protection. Industry associations have a key role to play in promoting standards.
Recommendations for NGOs

NGOs should play their role as facilitators and trainers of participatory processes, tourism planning and as social entrepreneurs within the tourist industry. NGOs at all levels should effectively participate in sharing with all, stakeholders experience and knowledge about successful strategies, obstacles and how to overcome them.

NGOs also should focus on holding roundtables, organizing events, and awareness campaigns with the intention of promoting CT sector, specifically raising awareness on increasing women participation in VCT schools, and long-term sustainable employment in Catering and Tourism sector.
ANEKSI I: Conference organized regarding presentation of the results derived from this research

On 19/02/2015 in municipality of Peja, respectively in Hotel Dukagjin, has been organized a conference with the purpose of presenting the results of the report "Research on Gender Barriers related to the Participation of Women in Education and Employment in Tourism Sector in Kosovo", which is part of the project "Support for the Development of Education and Employment" that is implemented by "Syri i Vizionit" and "Volkshilfe" organizations a project which is supported by ADA" Austrian Development Cooperation ". This conference was facilitated by Mr. Dukagjin Nishiqi, as a representative of the "Syri i Vizionit" organization.

The purpose of the conference was to notify the relevant regional stakeholders with the findings of this research and to raise a discussion on some of the problems that industry of catering and tourism in the region of Dukagjin is currently facing. During this conference besides presenting the findings, final suggestions and objections were raised from the participants, in order for this research to be published, and serve to the relevant institutions to which they address these results in the form of recommendations for future actions. Participants were of a strong opinion that recommendations derived from this research should be considered to be applied by the relevant institutions in order to improve the situation in catering and tourism sector.

After the presentation of results from Mr. Valon Feka - representative of UBO Consulting (that conducted the research) asked the participants to discuss and provide feedback and recommendations regarding the research and regarding the catering and tourism sector in general. Below we listed the recommendations that were raised from the participants:

- All relevant stakeholders involved ranging from government agencies and ministries, to local ones (municipalities, NGOs, civil civic initiatives) to create an action plan in order to implement and coordinate activities within national and regional development strategies regarding catering and tourism sector

- Actions (interventions) should be prioritized, according to the importance and the immediate need, so that interventions to be adequate and appropriate towards the situation on the ground

- To work more on youth employment in this sector in order to prevent young people from taking the path of immigration, participation of youth in religious fanatical groups, and involvement of youth in criminal acts, which all these actions make a unstable and dangerous future for youngsters
## ANNEX II: Detailed list of employers and stakeholders that were part of the survey

### Peja

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Surname</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Ifakete</td>
<td>Hoti</td>
<td>Vocational Training Center</td>
<td>Administrator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Bajram</td>
<td>Demaj</td>
<td>Regional Employment Center</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Avdyl</td>
<td>Gashi</td>
<td>VCT School &quot;Ali Hadri&quot;</td>
<td>Vice headmaster</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Prizren

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Surname</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Blerim</td>
<td>Shehu</td>
<td>Vocational Training Center</td>
<td>Administrator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Sadik</td>
<td>Ramadani</td>
<td>Regional Employment Center</td>
<td>Employment consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Myvedete</td>
<td>Gavazaj</td>
<td>VCT School &quot;Ymer Prizreni&quot;</td>
<td>Headmaster</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Gjakova

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Surname</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Shaban</td>
<td>Laha</td>
<td>Vocational Training Center</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Kujtim</td>
<td>Dula</td>
<td>Regional Employment Office</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Fakete</td>
<td>Elezi</td>
<td>Regional Employment Office</td>
<td>Employment consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Elvana</td>
<td>Olluni</td>
<td>VCT School &quot;Kadri Kusari&quot;</td>
<td>Vice headmaster</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Peja

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name of Business Interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Alba Air</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Hotel Dukagjini</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Sayonara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Zekaj Tours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Exim Tours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Pastiçeria Hamza</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Hotel Koha</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Dini Expreso</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Furra Hysaj</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Pranvera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Princ Caffe Shop</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Prizren

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name of Business Interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ajdo Grill</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Halimaj Raisen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Hotel Cleon</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Sharr Travel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Hotel OK</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Pastiçeria Karamel</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Zhur Tours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Hotel Luxory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Shpejtimi Tours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Hotel Theranda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Villa 100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Gjakova

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name of Business Interviewed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Bledi Tours</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Edona Raisen</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Happy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Hotel 4 Yjet</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Hotel Europa</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Jeta-O</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Fast Food Restaurant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Gezimi HAM HAM</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Qarshia Jupat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Meti Commerc</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Tirana Metropol</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Hotel Pashtriku</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### National Level Stakeholders

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Name and Surname</th>
<th>Institution</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Abdurrahman Simnica</td>
<td>Ministry of Education Science and Technology</td>
<td>Curricula coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Ryve Prekoraxha</td>
<td>Ministry of Education Science and Technology</td>
<td>Senior official for curricula</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ylber Aliu</td>
<td>Ministry of Labor and Social Wellbeing</td>
<td>Lead of Monitoring team of Employment offices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>